

CHATHAM COUNTY-SAVANNAH

METROPOLITAN PLANNING COMMISSION

Planning the Future - Respecting the Past

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room July 28, 2009 1:30 PM MINUTES

July 28, 2009 Regular MPC Board Meeting

Members Present:	Jon Todd, Chairman	
	Shedrick Coleman, Vice-Chairman	
	Adam Ragsdale, Secretary	
	Susan Myers, Treasurer	
	Ellis Cook	
	Ben Farmer	
	Timothy S. Mackey	
	Tanya Milton	
	Lacy Manigault	
	Jon Pannell	
	Jon Famen	
Members Not Present:	Stephen Lufburrow	
	Russell Abolt	
	Michael Brown	
	David Hoover	
Staff Present:	Thomas Thomson, P.E. AICP, Executive Director	
	Melony West, CPA, Director, Finance & Systems	
	James Hansen, AICP, Director, Development Services	
	Marcus Lotson, Development Services Planner	
	Jack Butler, Comprehensive Planner	
	Bri Finau, Administrative Assistant	
	Constance Morgan, Administrative Assistant	
	Christy Adams, Director of Administration	
	Marilyn Gignilliat, Executive Assistant	
	Beth Reiter, AICP, Director, Historic Review	
	Mark Wilkes, Director of Transportation	

Advisory Staff Present: Randolph Scott, City Zoning Inspector

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. INVOCATION

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

IV. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Notice(s)

1. July 28, 2009 MPC Finance Committee Meeting at 11:30 A.M. in the West Conference Room, 110 East State Street

2. <u>August 18, 2009 Regular MPC Meeting at 1:30 P.M. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 East State Street</u>

V. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

The Consent Agenda consists of items for which the applicant is in agreement with the staff recommendation and for which no known objections have been identified nor anticipated by staff. Any objections raised at the meeting will result in the item being moved to the Regular Agenda. At a 12:30 briefing, the staff will brief the Commission on Consent Agenda items, and, time permitting, Regular Agenda items. No testimony will be taken from applicants, supporters or opponents, and no votes will be taken at the briefing.

VI. CONSENT AGENDA

Approval of MPC Meeting Minutes and Briefing Minutes

3. Approval of July 7, 2009 MPC Meeting Minutes and Briefing Minutes

Attachment: 07.07.09 MPC BRIEFING MINUTES.pdf Attachment: 07.07.09 MPC Minutes.pdf

Motions:	
Recommend APPROVAL of the MPC Meeting and Briefing Minutes as submitted.	- PASS
Vote Results	
Motion: Jon Pannell	
Second: Susan Myers	
Shedrick Coleman	- Aye
Ellis Cook	- Aye

Ben Farmer	- Aye
Stephen Lufburrow	- Aye
Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Aye
Jon Pannell	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye
Jon Todd	- Aye

Victorian District - New Construction

4. <u>315 East Park Avenue - New construction of a detached single family dwelling and side yard setback variances.</u>

Attachment: <u>315EPark-Print.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Staff Report July 28, 2009.pdf</u>

Motions:

APPROVAL of the design of a one and one-half	
story single family detached dwelling and	- PASS
APPROVAL of a 3.5 foot side yard setback	17100
variance and a 1 foot side yard setback variance.	

Vote Results

Motion: S	Shedrick	Coleman
-----------	----------	---------

Second: Lacy	Manigault
--------------	-----------

Shedrick Coleman	- Aye
Ellis Cook	- Aye
Ben Farmer	- Aye
Stephen Lufburrow	- Aye
Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Aye
Jon Pannell	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye

Jon Todd

- Aye

VII. OLD BUSINESS

VIII. ITEMS MOVED FROM CONSENT AGENDA

IX. REGULAR BUSINESS

Tower - New Facility/Concealed Freestanding

5. Harvest Church of the Nazarene - 5995 Waters Avenue

Attachment: <u>CityScape Report.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>410-390 Final CDs-072209-Revised Plans.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Orthoview.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>WTF Report to MPC T-090223-36211-2-Print.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Photosims.pdf</u>

Minutes:

5995 Waters Avenue New Cellular WTF at Harvest Church of the Nazarene Aldermanic District: 4 County Commission District: 1 Zoning District: R-6 Acres: 1.46 PIN: 2-0132-02-015 Harvest Church of the Nazarene, Owner Fred Womble, SBA Network Services, Agent MPC File No. T-090223-36211-2

Jack Butler, MPC Project Planner

Request to construct a "light pole" flush-mounted 100-foot wireless telecommunications facility behind a church in a residential neighborhood.

Staff finds that requirements are met and is recommending that the MPC approve the proposed Wireless Telecommunications Facility at 5995 Waters Avenue as submitted. Further, it is recommended that the applicant be authorized to seek approval of a building permit from the City of Savannah Department of Building Services.

Mr. Lufburrow commended Mr. Thomson and his staff for meeting the needs of the Board in providing exceptional technical support.

Fred Womble, Zoning Specialist for SBA Network Services, stated it has been a positive learning experience with MPC and CityScape. He also noted that the lighting will be angled so as to not be intrusive the neighboring residents.

Mr. Mackey stated that the neighboring residents need to be informed that the ground

equipment can exude a humming sound at night and the equipment will need to be serviced periodically.

Mr. Tony Thomas, District 6 City Alderman, stated he is concerned with existing poles that are not in use, such as in Coffee Bluff across from Mount Herman and the upcoming petition for Uncle Bob's which is less than an mile from the one approved in Greenbriar. Are the locations being analyzed and how many signals can be utilized on a pole? Are poles being fully utilized before another is put up to service an area that may already have a pole in it? He stated he is concerned about the aesthetics of the City.

Mr. Todd said he had the same concern. He requested Mr. Thomson to update the inventory of the location of all the towers and the collocation of the towers, who was on them, and how many were filled. He stated there is a process that the Ordinance does require to prove need for a certain area. If there is a collocation, they have to use that collocation for approval. He stated they are bonded requires removal if inactive.

Mr. Thomas requested a copy of the report of the signals on those three poles.

Mr. Thomson stated he would be happy to provide and will also place on website. He informed the Ordinance a new freestanding tower cannot be had without first proving it cannot be concealed inside another building, or collocated on an existing building or tower. Also, the tower would have to have minimum impact and have space for a total of five signal uses. The tower petitions before the Board has met those qualifications.

Motions:

Staff is recommending that the MPC approve the proposed Wireless Telecommunications Facility at 5995 Waters Avenue as submitted. Further, it is recommended that the applicant be authorized to seek approval of a building permit from the City of Savannah Department of Building Services.

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Lufburrow

Second: Timothy Mackey

Stephen Lufburrow

- Shedrick Coleman
- Ellis Cook- AyeBen Farmer- Not
 - Not Present - Aye

- Aye

Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Aye
Jon Pannell	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye
Jon Todd	- Aye

Tower - New Facility/Nonconcealed Freestanding-Monopole

6. <u>Uncle Bob's Self - Storage -10901 Abercorn Street</u>

Attachment: <u>Additional PhotoSims.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>CityScape Report.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>CityScape Report MPC ATT Bobs 7 22 09 Addemdum (2).pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Ortho Imagery.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>OrthoZoning.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>SITEMAP.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>WTF Report to MPC T-090402-41934-2-Print.pdf</u>

Minutes:

10901 Abercorn Street New Cellular WTF at Uncle Bob's Storage Aldermanic District: 6 County Commission District: 6 Zoning District: PUD-BN Acres: 5.3 PIN: 2-0693-05-003 Savannah Storage Associates, Owner Fred Womble, SBA Network Services, Agent MPC File No. T-090402-41934-2

Jack Butler, MPC Project Planner

Request to construct a concealed 100-foot wireless telecommunications facility behind a self-storage facility. The petitioner has also requested a flush mounting.

Staff is recommending that the MPC approve the proposed Wireless Telecommunications Facility at 10901 Abercorn Street as submitted. Further, it is recommended that the applicant be authorized to seek approval of a building permit from the City of Savannah Department of Building Services.

Fred Womble, representing the petitioner, stated he would like to table the petition to the August 18, 2009 Regular MPC meeting to be sure the request was in compliance with the revised Ordinance. Due to timing, discussion of the flush mounting issue was not able to be

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room July 28, 2009 1:30 PM MINUTES

discussed adequately in order to present an appropriate request.

Motions:

Petitioner requested to postpone vote and to reappear before the Board at the August 18, 2009 MPC meeting. The petitioner would like to verify - PASS that the technical design proposed by his client is in compliance with the revised Ordinance.

Vote Results

Second: Timothy Mackey

Motion: Ben Farmer

	2	2
~		
Shedrick C	oleman	

	5
Ellis Cook	- Aye
Ben Farmer	- Aye
Stephen Lufburrow	- Aye
Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Aye
Jon Pannell	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye
Jon Todd	- Aye

Zoning Petition - Map Amendment

7. <u>216 Felt Drive request to rezone from an R-10 zoning classification to an R-20 zoning classification</u>

- Aye

Attachment: <u>Maps and Photos.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Staff Report rev..pdf</u>

Minutes:

216 Felt Drive Request to rezone property from R-10 to R-20 Aldermanic District: 6 County Commission District: 6 Zoning District: R-10 Acres: 9.73 PIN(s): 2-0763-01-026, 027, 028, 034 Lokesh Patel, Owner Harold Yellin, Agent MPC File No. Z-090618-33134-2

Marcus Lotson, MPC Project Planner

At issue is a request to rezone approximately 9.73 acres located at 216 Felt Drive from an R-10 zoning classification to an R-20 zoning classification.

The MPC staff recommends DENIAL of the request to rezone the property at 216 Felt Drive PIN(s) 2-0763-01-026, 027, 028, 034 from an R-10 zoning classification to an R-20 zoning classification.

Harold Yellin, speaking on behalf of the petitioner, showed a 2-minute presentation of Helen Stone's property with her horses. He stated it provided a serene, non-intrusive atmosphere for her neighbors. The petitioner would like the same for his daughter to learn to ride. Mr. Yellin noted that R-10 and R-20 are very similiar and the petitioner was not aware he was violating the Ordinance.

Mr. Manigault stated he's seen Ms. Stone's property. Her property is not adjacent to Coffee Point Plantation, a subdivision; her property is adjacent to other private owners. One must consider the houses to be built in that area. He stated her property was grandfathered in and the petitioner is in a different area under different standards.

Mr. Yellin replied that R-10's and R-20's are intermingled throughout Coffee Bluff and White Bluff which would allow unlimited number of horses. He stated many are not aware that the R-20 districts permit horses next to single family dwellings and it is unfortunate that the petitioner's lots were not included in the rezoning some years back.

Mr. Manigualt stated that would lead to spot zoning and that would not be allowed.

Mr. Yellin stated going from residential to residential would not be spot zoning according to Georgia law.

Mr. Todd stated that Mr. Patel purchased his property in 2004, zoned as R-10. He stated the neighboring properties purchased their homes understanding his property was zoned R-10. Mr. Patel now wishes to use his property for something for which it is not zoned, and is seeking it to be rezoned to use for that purpose.

Mr. Yellin stated that is correct, with the decision that the lots will never be subdivided to more than 2 per acre.

Mr. Willie Tate, citizen and resident of Felt Drive, stated he has nothing

against horses but does not want them in his neighborhood. He stated he is opposed because the neighborhood is R-10 as it was when he purchased it and like for it to remain that way.

Mr. Paul Hayes, citizen and resident of Felt Drive, stated they went to City Council in 2005 regarding Coffee Point regarding the issue of density, which was resolved. He stated now the issue is land use. He stated Mr.Patel has already put in a foundation for the stable close to Felt Drive, not in the rear as presented in the pictures. He stated though the petitioner has 9 acres of property, 2.5 acres are across the street and the horses will be on 6.5. He stated he and the neighbors would like to keep it as it is. He stated rezoning the property to R-20 would open the property up to a lot of uses in the future that may not be conducive the the neighborhood.

Ms. Mary Grant, citizen and resident of the area, stated she is very familiar with horses. However, her concern is if the zoning is changed, what will regulate it from going further than just horses? What about the additional mosquitoes that carry diseases they will attract to area? Will the horses be maintained? Will it change the value of the properties?

Mr. Tony Thomas, City Alderman, stated the issue is not density; it is getting a zoning classification that will allow horses. He stated the neighbors have spoken and the petitioner's request is not compatible with the neighborhood and plan put in place. He stated the plan can't be redone. He stated zoning should not be driven by what you want it to be; the petitioner should have explored what the zoning permitted him to do. He implored the Board to uphold the zoning standards and neighborhood as it is.

Motions:

Approval of the staff recommendation for DENIAL of the request to rezone the property at 216 Felt Drive PIN(s) 2-0763-01-026, 027, 028, - PASS 034 from an R-10 zoning classification to an R-20 zoning classification.

Vote Results

Motion: Ben Farmer

Second: Stephen Lufburrow

Shedrick Coleman Ellis Cook

Ben Farmer- AyeStephen Lufburrow- Aye

- Aye

- Aye

Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Aye
Jon Pannell	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye
Jon Todd	- Aye

8. <u>529 E. Liberty - request to rezone from the P-B-G-2 zoning classification to the RIP-B</u> zoning classification

Attachment: <u>staff rpt.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Case maps.pdf</u>

Minutes:

This item was moved from the Consent Agenda due to citizen request for information.

529 E. Liberty Aldermanic District:2 County Commission District:2 Existing Zoning:P-B-G-2 PIN:2-0014-13-012 Owner, David Udinsky Agent, Kimberly Iler MPC File No. Z-090701-47592-2 Marcus Lotson, MPC Project Planner

Staff recommends <u>APPROVAL</u> of the requested rezoning from the existing P-B-G-2 zoning classification to the proposed RIP-B zoning classification for the property (PIN # 2-0014-13-012) located at 529 East Liberty Street.

Mr. Lotson informed that under the current classification, a restaurant use would not be permitted, but allowed in the requested new zoning classification.

Mr. Ragsdale asked if no site improvements are planned, at what point would a general development plan be required?

Mr. Scott replied if it is allowed in the zone and perform no exterior work, no additional plans would be needed. Parking requirements would apply.

Mr. Thomson added that it would not necessrily have to return to the MPC but would need to get certificate of occupancy from the City after the use requirements are met.

Mr. Ragsdale asked if the parking lot met the design standards?

Mr. Scott stated not at this time because the zone would not allow. He stated he expects them to return to modify.

John Rolouet, petitioner, stated they are petitioning for rezoning and believed they have met all standards. He stated it would not be a regular bar and additional parking would be available across the street.

Ms. Shunaman, citizen, asked if the area is rezoned, will that allow for townhomes and the like in the area?

Mr. Lotson replied that the zoning may allow but the size of the lot would make it restrictive and not allow a residential component.

Nova Bernard, citizen, stated she appreciates the attempt the MPC to retain the continuity in the area. She stated she would like to express her concern that Savannah retains its status as a calling card.

Motions:

APPROVAL of the requested rezoning from the existing P-B-G-2 zoning classification to the proposed RIP-B zoning classification for the property (PIN # 2-0014-13-012) located at 529 East Liberty Street.

Vote Results

Motion: Shedrick Coleman

Wouldir. Sheurick Coleman	
Second: Tanya Milton	
Shedrick Coleman	- Aye
Ellis Cook	- Aye
Ben Farmer	- Aye
Stephen Lufburrow	- Aye
Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Aye
Jon Pannell	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye
Jon Todd	- Aye

X. OTHER BUSINESS

9. Finance Update

Minutes: Ms. Myers stated: "For the third quarter, our finances are on schedule. We have held the expenses down and are at present in good shape. Ms. West reported on going through with the new process with the City for funding. We don't have an idea as to where we are with that, but at the present time, we are fine."

10. Long Range Transportation Plan Update - Mark Wilkes, Beverly W. Davis, RS&H

Attachment: MPC Thomson LRTP Update 072409.pdf

Minutes:

Mr. Thomson presented the transportation department: Mark Wilkes, Michaeal Adams, Wykoda Wang, Jessica Mayfield, and Jane Love.

Mr. Thomson noted that contract the Board authorized to execute a contract with the City for \$250,000 provides the matching funds between City and County for \$1.2 million for federal transportation grants which will fund this study and others.

Mark Wilkes, P. E., AICP, Director of Transportation Planning updated the process we are taking to address the transportation needs of Savannah and Chatham County in the next twenty-five years. Beverly W. Davis, AICP, transportation planner with Reynolds Smith & Hills and consultant on the Long Range Transportation Plan Update, was a co-presenter.

Several public meetings have already been held to involve community members in the identification of goals and issues to be addressed in this document, which will be known as CORE Connections 2035.

Motions: For information only.

Vote Results

Motion:

Second:

11. Appointment of the Nominating Committee

Minutes:

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room July 28, 2009 1:30 PM MINUTES

Mr. Todd appointed the following Commissioners to the Nominating Committee: Stephen Lufburrow, Ellis Cook, and Ben Farmer.

XI. ADJOURNMENT